

Lauren M. Agunzo John K. Hoffman Darin V. Iacobelli David M. Tellier

April 13, 2020

VIA EMAIL

Ms. Kathi Kivi District Clerk East Ramapo Central School District 105 South Madison Avenue Spring Valley, NY 10977

Re: Claims Audit Report for March 2020

Dear Ms. Kivi:

Enclosed please find a copy of our Claims Audit Report for March 2020. Please distribute a copy to the Assistant Superintendent for Finance and distribute a copy to each of the Board members of the East Ramapo Central School District.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely yours,

Darin V. Iacobelli

Darin V. Iacobelli, CPA

Enclosure



Lauren M. Agunzo John K. Hoffman Darin V. Iacobelli David M. Tellier

April 13, 2020

VIA EMAIL

Board of Education East Ramapo Central School District 105 South Madison Avenue Spring Valley, NY 10977

> Re: Claims Audit Report for the Month of March 1, 2020 through March 31, 2020

Board of Education:

We have completed our claims auditing services to the East Ramapo Central School District covering the time period of March 1, 2020 through March 31, 2020. The services we performed, as outlined within our proposal, include reviewing all claims against the District. The purpose of this report is to update the Board of Education on work performed to date, our findings, and recommendations.

For ease of reference we have categorized the remainder of this report as follow:

Claims Audit Services

Exhibits

CLAIMS AUDIT SERVICES

The claims audit services performed on each claim against the District consisted of:

- 1. Verification of the accuracy of invoices and claim forms.
- 2. Ensuring proper approval of all purchases; checking that purchases constitute legal expenses of the school district.
- 3. Determining that purchase orders have been issued in accordance with Board of Education policy, and applicable state law.

Nawrocki Smith

Board of Education East Ramapo Central School District April 13, 2020 Page 2

> Re: Claims Audit Report for the Month of March 1, 2020 through March 31, 2020

- 4. Comparison of invoices or claims with previously approved contracts.
- 5. Reviewing price extensions, claiming of applicable discounts, inclusion of shipping and freight charges.
- 6. Approving all charges that are presented for payment which are supported with documentary evidence indicating compliance with all pertinent laws, policies and regulations.

Over the time period of March 1, 2020 through March 31, 2020 we have audited <u>1,308</u> claims against the District in the amount of <u>\$6,163,626.12</u> (See attached Exhibit I). We made inquiries and/or observations into <u>14</u> claims in the amount of <u>\$919,513.03</u>. It should be noted that currently, there are no outstanding inquiries in regard to the audit of claims made against the District for the period of July 1, 2019 through March 31, 2020. We have summarized the inquiries and/or observations as well as the resolutions within Exhibit II.

Please note that for comparative purposes, we have attached Exhibit II – "Summary of Inquiries/Resolutions" for each of the prior months, if applicable.

We trust that the foregoing comments are clear. If you have any questions or you would like to discuss this matter further, please contact me at 631-756-9500.

Very truly yours,

Nawrocki Smith LLP

Claims Audit By Fund East Ramapo Central School District Exhibit I March 2020

| Legend: | |
|------------------|---------------------|
| A - General | H - Capital |
| C - School Lunch | TA - Trust & Agency |
| F - Special Aid | CM - Scholarship |

| Check Date | Audit Date | Warrant # | Fund | # of | \$ Value of Checks # of I | naniries | \$ Value of | # of Resolved | # of Outstanding | Check Sequence |
|------------|-------------|------------|-------|--------|---|----------|---------------|---------------|------------------|----------------|
| Check Bute | Tradit Date | vvariant n | 1 unu | Checks | \$\forall \text{under of checks } n \text{ of } \forall | iquiries | Inquiries | Inquiries | Inquiries | oneen sequence |
| 03/06/20 | 03/05/20 | 193 | A | 86 | 395,911.08 | 9 | 60,962.01 | 9 | - | 409112-409197 |
| 03/06/20 | 03/05/20 | 196 | A | 20 | 1,841,736.88 | 1 | 82,698.27 | 1 | - | 409198-409217 |
| 03/06/20 | 03/05/20 | 195 | C | 1 | 567,643.41 | - | - | - | - | 16392 |
| 03/06/20 | 03/05/20 | 194 | F | 21 | 815,179.34 | 2 | 2,173.63 | 2 | - | 53172-53192 |
| 03/06/20 | 03/05/20 | 197 | Н | 7 | 253,336.99 | - | - | - | - | 337-343 |
| TOT | ΓAL | | • | 135 | \$ 3,873,807.70 | 12 | \$ 145,833.91 | 12 | - | |

| Check Date | Audit Date | Warrant # | Fund | # of | \$ Value of Cheeks # of I | \$ Value of Checks # of Inquiries | | | # of Outstanding | Check Sequence |
|------------|------------|------------|------|--------|---------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------|-----------|------------------|----------------|
| Check Date | Audit Date | vvarrant # | runu | Checks | 5 value of Checks # of 1 | iiquii ies | Inquiries | Inquiries | Inquiries | Check Sequence |
| 03/20/20 | 03/19/20 | 199 | A | 9 | 454,268.69 | - | - | - | - | 409218-409226 |
| 03/31/20 | 03/19/20 | 201 | A | 1105 | 639,568.00 | - | - | - | - | 409227-410331 |
| 03/20/20 | 03/19/20 | 202 | A | 45 | 251,191.76 | - | - | - | - | 410332-410376 |
| 03/20/20 | 03/19/20 | 200 | F | 14 | 944,789.97 | 2 | 773,679.12 | 2 | - | 53193-53206 |
| TOT | TAL | | | 1173 | \$ 2,289,818.42 | 2 | 773,679.12 | 2 | - | |

| GRAND TOTAL 1506 \$ 0,105,020.12 14 \$ 919,515.05 14 - | GRAND TOTAL | 1308 | \$ | 6,163,626.12 | 14 \$ | 9 | 19,513.03 | 14 | - | |
|--|-------------|------|----|--------------|-------|---|-----------|----|---|--|
|--|-------------|------|----|--------------|-------|---|-----------|----|---|--|

*Payroll Warrants are included for informational purposes only and have not been reviewed.

| Check Date | Payroll Run | Warrant # | Fund | # of | ¢ Vol | ue of Checks # | of Inquiries | \$ Value of | # of Resolved | # of Outstanding | Check Sequence |
|------------|-------------|-----------|------|--------|-------|----------------|--------------|-------------|---------------|------------------|--------------------|
| Check Date | Date | vvarram # | runa | Checks | ф van | ue of Checks # | or inquiries | Inquiries | Inquiries | Inquiries | Check Sequence |
| 03/13/20 | 03/13/20 | 198 | TA | 47 | 2 | 2,140,536.05 | - | - | - | - | 37005-37021; Wires |
| 03/27/20 | 03/27/20 | 203 | TA | 46 | 2 | 2,148,573.64 | - | - | - | - | 37022-37037; Wires |
| 02/28/20 | 02/28/20 | 213 | TA | 1 | | 52,549.09 | - | - | - | - | Wire |
| TO | ΓAL | | | 94 | \$ 4 | 4,341,658.78 | - | - | - | - | |

East Ramapo Central School District Claims Audit - Analysis by Number of Inquiries & Dollar Value Summary of Inquiries / Resolutions and Percentage of Total Claims & Dollar Value of Claims Exhibit II

2019 / 2020 YTD

| Reason For Inquiry | Resolution | <u>Jul-19</u> | | Aug-19 | | Sep-19 | | Oct-19 | | Nov-19 | | Dec-19 | |
|---|----------------------------------|---------------|---------|--------|---------|--------|---------|--------|---------|--------|---------|--------|---------|
| Incorrect accounts payable amount | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Incorrect accounts payable amount | Amount adjusted prior to payment | 4 | 1.00% | 2 | 0.72% | 4 | 0.26% | 4 | 0.78% | 2 | 0.36% | 3 | 0.18% |
| Paid sales tax | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | 1 | 0.36% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Paid sales tax | Amount adjusted prior to payment | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | 1 | 0.07% | 1 | 0.19% | 1 | 0.18% | - | 0.00% |
| Incorrect remittance address | Address verified | 3 | 0.75% | 1 | 0.36% | 1 | 0.07% | 9 | 1.75% | 8 | 1.46% | 1 | 0.06% |
| Insufficient supporting documentation | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Invoice date precedes purchase order date | Noted by Business Office | 15 | 3.75% | 22 | 7.97% | 29 | 1.91% | 64 | 12.43% | 50 | 9.11% | 28 | 1.71% |
| Invoice over 90 days outstanding | Verified not a duplicate payment | 18 | 4.50% | 8 | 2.90% | 17 | 1.12% | 12 | 2.33% | 19 | 3.46% | 6 | 0.37% |
| Missing receiving or approval signature | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Not an original invoice or receipt | Copy or fax accepted | 1 | 0.25% | - | 0.00% | 1 | 0.07% | - | 0.00% | 1 | 0.18% | 1 | 0.06% |
| Receipts not itemized | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Total Number (#) of Inquiries | | 41 | 10.25% | 34 | 12.32% | 53 | 3.49% | 90 | 17.48% | 81 | 14.75% | 39 | 2.38% |
| Total Claims Audited | | 400 | 100.00% | 276 | 100.00% | 1,517 | 100.00% | 515 | 100.00% | 549 | 100.00% | 1,639 | 100.00% |
| Total Outstanding Inquiries | | none | | none | | none | | none | | none | | none | |

| Reason For Inquiry | Resolution | <u>Jul-19</u> | | Aug- | 9 | Sep-19 | | Oct-19 | | Nov-19 | | Dec-19 | |
|---|-----------------------------------|------------------|---------|-----------------|---------|------------------|---------|------------------|---------|------------------|---------|------------------|---------|
| Incorrect accounts payable amount | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Incorrect accounts payable amount* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | 133,979.01 | 1.09% | 2,998.3 | 0.02% | 17,065.84 | 0.11% | 154,758.97 | 1.02% | 312,950.57 | 2.16% | 7,663.08 | 0.04% |
| Paid sales tax | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | 511.1 | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Paid sales tax* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | - | 0.00% | | 0.00% | 340.88 | 0.00% | 339.67 | 0.00% | 3,223.33 | 0.02% | - | 0.00% |
| Incorrect remittance address | Address verified | 2,554.80 | 0.02% | 22,617.8 | 0.18% | 10,468.00 | 0.07% | 13,142.84 | 0.09% | 123,695.20 | 0.85% | 313.36 | 0.00% |
| Insufficient supporting documentation | n/a | - | 0.00% | | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Invoice date precedes purchase order date | Noted by Business Office | 1,801,840.05 | 14.68% | 248,271.8 | 1.99% | 337,544.72 | 2.13% | 1,039,796.30 | 6.89% | 2,083,390.29 | 14.38% | 4,653,601.19 | 24.74% |
| Invoice over 90 days outstanding | Verified not a duplicate payment | 181,233.64 | 1.48% | 44,535.7 | 0.36% | 3,420,515.14 | 21.58% | 19,965.94 | 0.13% | 300,920.01 | 2.08% | 103,501.46 | 0.55% |
| Missing receiving or approval signature | n/a | - | 0.00% | | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Not an original invoice or receipt | Copy or fax accepted | 315.91 | 0.00% | | 0.00% | 465.22 | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | 528.48 | 0.00% | 17.62 | 0.00% |
| Receipts not itemized | n/a | - | 0.00% | | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% |
| Total Value (\$) of Inquiries | | \$ 2,119,923.41 | 17.27% | \$ 318,934.8 | 2.56% | \$ 3,786,399.80 | 23.89% | \$ 1,228,003.72 | 8.13% | \$ 2,824,707.88 | 19.49% | \$ 4,765,096.71 | 25.33% |
| Total Claims Audited | | \$ 12,275,690.30 | 100.00% | \$ 12,458,211.4 | 100.00% | \$ 15,848,004.36 | 100.00% | \$ 15,101,481.37 | 100.00% | \$ 14,491,278.22 | 100.00% | \$ 18,809,839.42 | 100.00% |
| Total Outstanding Inquiries | | none | | noi | e | none | | none | | none | | none | |

^{*} Note: Inquiry Amounts for each month reflect the entire check amounts associated with each incorrect accounts payable amount and paid sales tax inquires.

The table below reflects each month's actual net adjustment for incorrect accounts payable amount and paid sales tax inquiries.

| Reason For Inquiry | Resolution | <u>Jul-19</u> | | | Aug-19 | | Sep-19 | | Oct-19 | | Nov-19 | | Dec-19 | |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------|---------|---------|------------|---------|---------------------|---------|---------------------|---------|---------------------|---------|---------------------|---------|
| Incorrect accounts payable amount* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | \$ (24,074.35) | -0.20% | \$ | (0.80) | 0.00% | \$ (215.53) | 0.00% | \$ (7,277.15) | -0.05% | \$ (30,000.40) | -0.21% | \$ 659.70 | 0.00% |
| Paid sales tax* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | \$ - | 0.00% | \$ | - | 0.00% | \$ (26.06) | 0.00% | \$ (28.45) | 0.00% | \$ (0.10) | 0.00% | \$ - | 0.00% |
| Total Claims Audited | | \$ 12,251,615.95 | 100.00% | \$ 12,4 | 458,210.60 | 100.00% | \$ 15,847,762.77 | 100.00% | \$ 15,094,175.77 | 100.00% | \$ 14,461,277.72 | 100.00% | \$ 18,810,499.12 | 100.00% |

East Ramapo Central School District

Claims Audit - Analysis by Number of Inquiries & Dollar Value Summary of Inquiries / Resolutions and Percentage of Total Claims & Dollar Value of Claims Exhibit II

2019 / 2020 YTD

| Reason For Inquiry | Resolution | <u>Jan-20</u> | | Feb-20 | | Mar-20 | | Apr-20 | May-20 | <u>Jun-20</u> |
|---|----------------------------------|---------------|---------|--------|---------|--------|---------|--------|--------|---------------|
| Incorrect accounts payable amount | Adjust next invoice | = | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Incorrect accounts payable amount | Amount adjusted prior to payment | 3 | 0.46% | 2 | 0.35% | 5 | 0.38% | | | |
| Paid sales tax | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Paid sales tax | Amount adjusted prior to payment | 1 | 0.15% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Incorrect remittance address | Address verified | 2 | 0.31% | 3 | 0.52% | 1 | 0.08% | | | |
| Insufficient supporting documentation | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Invoice date precedes purchase order date | Noted by Business Office | 35 | 5.40% | 31 | 5.38% | 5 | 0.38% | | | |
| Invoice over 90 days outstanding | Verified not a duplicate payment | 15 | 2.31% | 10 | 1.74% | 3 | 0.23% | | | |
| Missing receiving or approval signature | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Not an original invoice or receipt | Copy or fax accepted | 1 | 0.15% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Receipts not itemized | Noted by Business Office | 2 | 0.31% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Total Number (#) of Inquiries | | 59 | 9.10% | 46 | 7.99% | 14 | 1.07% | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total Claims Audited | | 648 | 100.00% | 576 | 100.00% | 1,308 | 100.00% | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total Outstanding Inquiries | | none | | none | | none | | | | |

| Reason For Inquiry | Resolution | <u>Jan-20</u> | | Feb-20 | | Mar-20 | | Apr-20 | May-20 | <u>Jun-20</u> |
|---|-----------------------------------|------------------|---------|------------------|---------|-----------------|---------|--------|--------|---------------|
| Incorrect accounts payable amount | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Incorrect accounts payable amount* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | 19,986.28 | 0.12% | 5,208.41 | 0.04% | 9,147.68 | 0.15% | | | |
| Paid sales tax | Adjust next invoice | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Paid sales tax* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | 301.17 | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Incorrect remittance address | Address verified | 19,818.34 | 0.12% | 3,155.50 | 0.02% | 9.43 | 0.00% | | | |
| Insufficient supporting documentation | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Invoice date precedes purchase order date | Noted by Business Office | 2,395,068.57 | 14.98% | 607,790.38 | 4.25% | 90,834.88 | 1.47% | | | |
| Invoice over 90 days outstanding | Verified not a duplicate payment | 16,112.96 | 0.10% | 100,542.62 | 0.70% | 819,521.04 | 13.30% | | | |
| Missing receiving or approval signature | n/a | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Not an original invoice or receipt | Copy or fax accepted | 1,636.36 | 0.01% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Receipts not itemized | Noted by Business Office | 639.45 | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | - | 0.00% | | | |
| Total Value (\$) of Inquiries | | \$ 2,453,563.13 | 15.34% | \$ 716,696.91 | 5.01% | \$ 919,513.03 | 14.92% | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total Claims Audited | | \$ 15,989,693.05 | 100.00% | \$ 14,308,953.86 | 100.00% | \$ 6,163,626.12 | 100.00% | | | |
| | _ | | | | | | | _ | | _ |
| Total Outstanding Inquiries | | none | | none | | none | | | | |

^{*} Note: Inquiry Amounts for each month reflect the entire check amounts associated with each incorrect accounts payable amount and paid sales tax inquires.

The table below relfects each month's actual net adjustment for incorrect accounts payable amount and paid sales tax inquiries.

| Reason For Inquiry | Resolution | Jan-20 | | Feb-20 | | Mar-20 | | Apr-20 | May-20 | <u>Jun-20</u> |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------|---------|---------------------|---------|--------------------|---------|--------|--------|---------------|
| Incorrect accounts payable amount* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | \$ 13,850.10 | 0.09% | \$ 0.74 | 0.00% | \$ 3.17 | 0.00% | | | |
| Paid sales tax* | Amount adjusted prior to payment* | \$ (1.33) | 0.00% | \$ - | 0.00% | \$ - | 0.00% | | | |
| Total Claims Audited | | \$ 16,003,541.82 | 100.00% | \$ 14,308,954.60 | 100.00% | \$ 6,163,629.29 | 100.00% | | | |